

**Carter's argument against the modified bundle theory of (material) particulars:**

One of the qualities of each material particular is the (unique) location at which it exists at any given time. This seems to allow two particulars to have all their other qualities in common just by taking into account the fact that no two particulars can be in the same place at the same time.

A problem for the Modified bundle theory of particulars

Suppose that, at time T1,

- 1) Some red particular, W, exists in Wyoming
- 2) A particular is (nothing more than) a collection of qualities
- 3) Each of a particular's qualities is a part of that particular
- 4) Whole particulars have all the parts of each of their parts
- 5) The parts of a whole particular have the same location as the whole particular
- 6) Red is a quality of W (1, 2)
- 7) Red is a part of W (6, 3)
- 8) Red is in Wyoming (7, 5)
- 9) Being in Wyoming is a quality of red (8, 2)
- 10) Being in Wyoming is part of red (9, 3)
- 11) Particular B (Jill's hat) is red (given)
- 12) Red is a quality of B (2, 11)
- 13) Red is a part of B (12, 3)
- 14) Being in Wyoming is part of B (13,10,4)
- 15) B is in Wyoming (14, 4)

Given 1) - 5) and 11) , statement (15) would have to be true, *even if in fact B were in Boston at T1*

The difficulty stems from treating material particulars as nothing more than the sum of their parts and from maintaining that their parts are all qualities.

Carter's reconstruction of Kripke's argument against Berkeley's idealism

- 1) If a CPT is a collection of SQ, then each part of this collection is a SQ
- 2) All SQ are universals
- 3) All universals are things that can exist in two places at once.
- 4) If a CPT is a collection of SQ, then each part of a CPT can exist in two places at once.
- 5) All molecules are particulars
- 6) No particular can exist in two places at once
- 7) If a CPT is a collection of molecules, then each part of this collection is a particular
- 8) If a CPT is a collection of molecules, then no part of this collection can exist in two places at once.
- 9) If a CPT is a collection of molecules then none of its parts is a universal.
- 10) If a CPT is a collection of molecules, then none of its parts is a SQ
- K) If genuine water is H<sub>2</sub>O, then it is necessarily true that genuine water is H<sub>2</sub>O
- 11) If genuine water is H<sub>2</sub>O then each drop of genuine water is necessarily a collection of molecules
- 12) Genuine water is H<sub>2</sub>O
- 13) Each drop of genuine water is necessarily a collection of molecules
- 14) It is necessarily true that no drop of genuine water is a collection of SQ